# **REPUBLIC OF KENYA**

# MANDERA COUNTY ASSEMBLY

# THE HANSARD

Wednesday, 19th August, 2020

The House met in the Assembly Chambers County Assembly Buildings at 2:33 p.m.

[Deputy Speaker (Hon. Farah Abdi) in the chair]

#### PRAYER

#### **MESSAGE FROM THE GOVERNOR**

#### NOMINATION OF PERSONS TO EL-WAK MUNICIPALITY BOARD

**Deputy Speaker** (Hon. Farah Abdi): Pursuant to the Provision of Standing Order No. 42 (1), I am in receipt of notification from the Governor of Mandera County, H.E Ali Ibrahim Roba, vide letter dated 17<sup>th</sup> August, 2020 on El-wak Municipality Board Members Nominees in exercise of power conferred to him by Section 14 of Urban Areas and Cities (Amendment) Act 2019 for County Assembly Approval as follows;

- 1. Mr. Said Ibrahim Hassan—ID. No.22 457410.
- 2. Mr. Abdullahi Hassan Khala—ID. No. 29548459
- 3. Mrs. Amina Maalim Ibrahim--- ID. No. 0207021
- 4. Mr. Ismail Hassan Issack--- ID. No. 11550995
- 5. Mr. Shukri Mohamed Hussein—ID. No. 29856184
- 6. Mr. Hassan Sheikh Alio---ID. No. 25852907
- 7. Mrs. Kadija Issack Ibrahim--- ID. No. 8760012

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 7 (1) of Public Appointments (County Assemblies Approval) Act No. 5 of 2017 and Section 193 (5) (f), I hereby commit the nominees to the Committee on Lands, Housing and Physical Planning for Vetting.

NOMINATION OF MANDERA COUNTY EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEMBERS

**Deputy Speaker** (Hon. Farah Abdi): Pursuant to the provision of Standing Order No. 42 (1) I am in receipt of notification from the Governor of Mandera County, H.E Ali Ibrahim Roba vide letter dated 18<sup>th</sup> August, 2020 on the Nomination of Mandera County Executive Committee

**Disclaimer:** The electronic version of the Mandera County Assembly Hansard Report is for information purposes only. A certified version of this Report can be obtained from the Hansard Editor, Mandera County Assembly.

1

Members in exercise of power conferred to him by Article 235 (1), 179 (2) (b) of Constitution of Kenya 2010 read with Section 235 (1) (a), (b), 30 (d) (e) of County Governments Act of 2012 for the County Assembly's Approval as follows;

- 1. Mr. Adan Dakane Hamud---ID. NO. 9567736- Department Trade Industrialization and Cooperative Development.
- 2. Mrs. Nadhifa Ahmed Mohamed –ID. No. 26671794- Department of Gender and Social Services
- 3. Mrs. Rahma Abdow Abdirahman—ID No. 13331601-Departemnt of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries.

Pursuant to the provision of Section 7(1), Public Appointments (County Assemblies Approval) Act No. 5 of 2017 and Standing Order No. 187 (4), I now commit the nominees for the County Executive Committee Members for vetting to the Committee on Appointments.

Thank you. Next Order!

#### PAPER LAID

#### MANDERA COUNTY GOVERNMENT BUDGET 2020/2021

Deputy Speaker (Hon. Farah Abdi): Leader of Minority.

**Hon. Jimale Abdi** (Guba): Mr. Deputy Speaker, I beg to lay the following Paper on the Table of the County Assembly today, Wednesday, 19<sup>th</sup> August, 2020 at 2:30 p.m.;

1. Mandera County Government Budget 2020/2021. Thank you.

(Hon. Jimale laid the document on the Table and it was committed to the Committee on Budget and Appropriations)

#### **STATEMENTS**

**Deputy Speaker** (Hon. Farah Abdi): Honorable Members, we have responses and we will start with the response from Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee; Hon. Chair for Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee.

Hon. Bashir Ibrahim (Kiliwehiri): Mr. Deputy Speaker, the response reads as follows; -

Reference is made to your letter REF. MCA/EX/1/Vol. 059 regarding the status of both El-wak South Slaughterhouse and Rhamu Slaughter house.

Fore question one, the department is aware of the condition of El-wak and Rhamu slaughterhouses. Rhamu slaughter house, piping for water has been done and there was breakdown of the generator pumping water to the tank. The generator is being worked on and other plans are underway to connect the slaughter house to electricity to enable a mortar being fixed.

For El-wak slaughter house, it has shallow well and an open soak pit. The drainage to the two slaughter houses have problem with waste disposal. The running of the slaughter houses is a

collaborative effort between the Department of Veterinary Services, Public Health Department and the Town Administrator.

The Public Health Department is to make sure sanitation and waste disposal is done. They have also been doing meat inspection in the right way and at the right time. The waste is to be collected by the Town Administrator and thus the Circular being addressed to the same through letter Ref: MDRS/PH/SAN/VOL.2/20 of 14<sup>th</sup> July 2020.

**Deputy Speaker** (Hon. Farah Abdi): Please, if you are not seating at the designated seat then go to Committee Room 1. Hon. Alinur Hassan, please go to Committee Room 1.

Hon. Bashir Ibrahim (Kiliwehiri): Response to question No. 2 reads; -

The department is aware of the status of the two slaughter houses as a main revenue stream in the Sub-Counties. This is made possible by the collaboration between Committee, and County Treasury through officers posted to collect revenue and the department.

Answer to question No. 3, is that the two slaughter houses have been budgeted for FY 2020/2021 to cater for the small repairs of the same that includes; drainage, soak pit and waste disposal.

As slaughter houses are run by different officers from different departments with different functions, the department is in the process of forming a multi-disciplinary coordination committee for better collaboration between the departments. This is for better communication and reduces overlap and duplication in carrying out different mandates.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

**Deputy Speaker** (Hon. Farah Abdi): We go to the next statement; Chairperson for Health Services.

Hon. Kulow Alio (Rhamu): I have something to say.

Deputy Speaker (Hon. Farah Abdi): Ok.

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker. I want to thank the Chairperson for Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee for having brought the response to the statement that we generated. But I have the following observations because one of the slaughter houses that has been mentioned and responded to is from my Ward.

The Rhamu slaughter house is in deplorable condition as alleged by the Chair. And some of the key things affecting that slaughter house are the camel slabs. That was a slaughter house that was built many years ago and it had a small space for camels to be slaughtered there. One of the predicaments of the Bushmen of my area is that it has adequate space for slaughtering camels. That is one of the biggest problem that we have there. It has not been mentioned by the Chair.

When you have the cattle slab; it has to be fenced and that has not been mentioned either. The issue about water piping system is correct and the area is piped to water system. It has an elevated tank and it has an underground tank. The water normally goes to the underground water tank. The problem we have is that the only generator that is working as he has clearly stated is not functional for many months now.

The other problem he said is that the generator pumping water to the tank, it is not actually to the tank that we have the problem with but it is from the tank to the slaughter house. We have water in the tank but we have no generator because it is not multi-functional to pump water from the tank to the slaughter house. That is the problem we had and it is the opposite of what the Chairman said.

The other problem that he has actually mentioned is that for us to get rid of this problem of the generator it has to be connected to electricity and we have a pole which is only some few meters from the slaughter house. But what is worrying me is question No. 3. If I just refer you there, the two slaughter houses have been budgeted for in the FY 2020/2021 and I applaud him for that. But look at what that budget is going to cover. The Chairman says that it is going to cover only drainage, soak pit and waste disposal. The key problem that the slaughter house had has not been catered for in the said budget. The reason why I asked those questions is that I want this issue to be captured in the budget that is before this House. The soak pit is only there but for the case of Rhamu we have no issue with soak pit and waste disposal. I do not know for my counterpart of El-wak north.

I feel that the issues I raised have not been properly addressed by the Chair and I seek your indulgence.

Thank you.

Deputy Speaker (Hon. Farah Abdi): Hon. Adan.

**Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed** (El-wak North): I also take this opportunity to thank the Chairperson for Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries for the timely response to this statement for Rhamu and El-wak Slaughter houses.

I am the generator of this statement and I have accommodated Rhamu slaughter house because of the similarity of the problem. Those tow slaughter houses were under deplorable condition.

Our only prayer is only addressed in question No. 3, if that will come true. If that problem of slaughter house can be solved in this financial year of 2020/2021 which has been laid by the Minority Leader before us right now that budget will solve the problem that is faced by our people in El-wak and Rhamu.

Deputy Speaker (Hon. Farah Abdi) left the Chair

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Sokorey) took the Chair

**Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed** (El-wak north): Madam Temporary Speaker, I would request the indulgence of the Chair of Budget and Appropriations Committee that if this statement will be locked out of the budget, I request this House to make it real and to be placed in this year's budget.

I rest my case.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Bishar!

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. My only concern about the statement is question No. 3. I had also similar problem in Takaba but such response that the ministry gave was not honored. The response says that they have catered for this in the FY 2020/2021. We need to confirm this because what we have seen in such response about the detailed report but in action it does not reflect on the budget.

I am pre-empting that these two slaughter houses might not have been captured in the budget. We want to defer this statement until when we see that it is reflected in the budget. I want to seek your direction on what the department said that these slaughter houses are captured

in the budget. If it is not captured in the budget what cause of action will we take against this officer who lied to this House?

(Applause)

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Chairperson for Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries.

**Hon. Bashir Ibrahim Alio** (Kiliwehiri): I think the statement has been well answered. Honorable Kulow is asking about the land which was not one of the questions in the statement; expansion of land is not there. So, we cannot bring it and put it in the response because it is not there. Hon. Kulow Alio has talked about fencing and those things and it is not there.

On the budget, they catered for small repairs which include payment of electricity bill and others.

The committee and I have found that this response is satisfactory.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Member for Wargadud.

**Hon. Alinoor Derow** (Wargadud): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. My issue is about question no. 3 especially on operation and management of slaughter houses within the county that the Executive said that there is going to be multi-disciplinary team to oversee how things will be operated in terms of slaughter houses. Meaning that there are many departments with co-functions related with the operations of slaughter houses.

Most of the slaughter houses within this county are subject to closure due to public health interest and failure by the department to undertake its mandates to ensure safety of public is taken care of.

Only two slaughter houses have been measured in this statement but the reality on the ground is that several slaughter houses are on the verge of closure and it is in the interest of service delivery that the status of various slaughter houses within this county need to be assessed.

I request for your direction relating to this so that Agriculture and livestock Committee can carry out site visit and come up with a comprehensive report regarding several slaughter houses in this county.

With that, thank you.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Honorable Members, the way I see the questions are not adequately answered especially on statement No. 3. I therefore direct the Chairperson for Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee to respond one week after recess.

#### (Applause)

Next statement by Honorable Ahmed Gabnan! Chair for Health Services.

Hon. Hindia Hussein (Nominated): Madam Temporary Speaker, my Vice-Chair is around but he requested me to read the response.

Following the request for statement by Hon. Ahmed Gabnan Ali, Member for Waranqara Ward on the floor of the House from the Chairperson of Health Services Committee, Ref: MCA/EX/HSC/GEN. VOL.1 (070) dated 28<sup>th</sup> July, 2020 in regard to closure of Waranqara

Health Centre, the County Executive Committee Member for Health Services; Mandera County Government hereby submit the ministerial statements in response to request for statements as follows;

1. Whether the department is aware of closure of Waranqara Health Centre due to lack of health personnel?

The Department is not aware of Waranqara Health Centre is closed but what the department is aware is that following terror attack targeting Safaricom Mast which is located within the compound of Waranqara Health Centre, fear and tension gripped the entire staff. After that fearful incident, the staffs requested for two (2) weeks off duty which was granted to allow staffs to get psychological rest of mind. So, Waranqara Health Centre is fully operational with three (3) technical staffs and five (5) supportive staffs.

2. What immediate plan does the department have to operationalize the facility?

The facility is already operational but requires an additional staff which the department is planning to rationalize staffs across the county and thereafter deploy staffs to facilities that have serious gaps based on service delivery of workload of the facilities. Due to the insecurity situation, the department will endeavor to post local staffs who may be able to bear these recurring challenges.

3. Why Gari and Waranqara Health Centres did not get any new posting of the Health Care Workers despite the staffing challenges?

The new posting of staffs following the new recruitment under Universal Health Coverage (UHC) was mainly informed by the operationalization of new and closed facilities and respective facility service delivery of workload.

In Lafey Sub-County, the department operationalized four (4) previously closed facilities due to lack of staffs; these includes Bambo, Kabo, Damasa and Alungu health facilities. Most of these newly operationalized facilities are in hardship areas and hard to reach localities with the nearest referral facility been more than 20 kilometers away.

To ensure accessibility to health care service provision by all communities in tandem with the use of Universal Health Coverage (UHC) objective, the department prioritized previously closed and newly completed facilities to be operationalized as first priority which has since successfully achieved across the county.

Other than the four (4) facilities that were operationalized using the newly posted staffs, Gari dispensary got two (2) additional staffs; Nutrition and Dietetic Officer and a Community Health Officer. Waranqara has already three (3) officers, Nursing Officer, Laboratory Technologist and a Nutrition Officer who have been adequately manning the facility without any challenge.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Member for Waranqara.

**Hon. Ahmed Gabnan** (Waranqara): The information provided is detailed for nothing. The questions I asked were answered but not the way I requested. I am the area representative. The day I sought this statement, two (2) days before I was at the Ward and I can even give clips to this Assembly, if you can allow me, of the public crying that there is common flu and a lot of diseases and the facility was not operational for one month. To state that Waranqara Health centre has not been closed is misleading Madam Temporary Speaker. Community health workers

cannot be regarded as staff of the facility. If the nurse is not there, how are the community health workers helpful to the community who are to get services from that health centre?

All the members know that over 150 Registered Clinical Officers, Nurses and Lab technologist were employed in the last four months and the total numbers of health staff are over 300. Unfortunately the CEC for Health is not ashamed of himself to state that Lafey Sub County got, although I have not seen that information, four nurses and RCOs were posted to the facilities that were closed. He is not answering the reason as to why Waranqara and Gari are not getting new staff. I asked why they have not benefitted and that question has not been answered. He is telling us Lafey got four which I have not asked whether they got 30 or 40. What I know is that Gari has been operating with one nurse who took leave for two months. There is no one to replace him when he was away. We know Mandera health centre staffs are overcrowded. They have over 8 staffs in this county and another health centre is operating with one staff and the CEC is telling us Lafey has four staffs as if I sought for that information.

I, therefore, humbly request the committee chair that the information that has been provided, you may have took it as a facts, but I can confirm to you that you have been misinformed and it is not the reality on the ground. I humbly request you to go for a fact finding mission and witness yourselves.

I am not satisfied with the response.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Kulow!

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I am a member of health committee. We discussed this statement at the committee level. I want to take the Honorable members through what the Honorable member asked. The Honorable member came late besides having the response to the statement. Question one and two passed him and he only heard question number three. I want to put him in the right perspective. He asked whether the department is aware of the closure of Waranqara health centre due to lack of health personnel. I will just pick what the department said. The department is not aware that Waranqara health centre is closed.

**Hon. Ahmed Gabnan** (Waranqara): Madam Temporary Speaker, the Member for Rhamu should give respect to the person who sought this statement and sympathize with the people of Waranqara. You cannot stand here and tell me that I asked the questions that I do not know. My friend, just withdraw and apologize. He said I came late when I was watching from committee room 1 and was following from the beginning only that spaces where not available. He should withdraw.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Kulow!

Hon. Kulow Alio (Rhamu): Madam Temporary Speaker, I was only saying---

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Kulow, if your statement has irritated the Honourable member, kindly withdraw.

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): I was only saying the Honorable member was not in the House when Honorable Hindia was reading the response and it is true he was not in the House.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Proceed.

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker, for defending me. The CEC was saying the mast that was attacked by Al- Shabaab was in the compound of Warangara health centre. After that incident off course if it is me and the mast is in the health

centre I will fear for my life. The CEC said the staffs fear for their lives and they opted to go for two weeks to rest because of that incident.

He also said Waranqara health centre is fully operational. If the CEC lied to this House and the information he gave us is not true, then we have a bone to break with him as the Health committee. For now we take the response as it is on the floor of the House.

Second question raised was, what immediate plan does the department have to operationalize the facility? The facility is already operational as they have said in question one. It only requires additional staff which they have already received in question number three.

For the case of Gari on why Gari and Waranqara did not get any new posting of health workers despite the staffing challenges, the CEC rightly said that Gari has had two more additional staffs and the same for Waranqara.

So, I think the statement asked is fully answered.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Wariyo!

**Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo** (Shimpir Fatuma): Madam Temporary Speaker, I know Hon. Kulow is a Member of Health committee and he has gone through this response before some of us. Honestly, the elected member of that ward has a concern which he raised. He has a very good point and he has all the rights to say that he is not satisfied. I also believe this is not satisfactory. I want the Health Committee Members to allow other members to look at this statement before defending it because we will use different lanes to read the response.

Madam Temporary Speaker, I want to pick on the first question, whether the department is aware of the closure of Waranqara health centre due to lack of health personnel. I do not know whether we understand it differently or what we are reading is different to be honest. The department is not aware. He said the department is not aware and again goes ahead and says Waranqara health facility is closed. The department is aware is that following a terror attack targeting safaricom mast located within the centre of Waranqara health centre, the staff ran away. How will the health centre operate without staff? First he has to accept. This is the man that has been sworn by the Holy Quran. He is stating that the facility was closed for a while and this is what the member is trying to look for.

If the CEC is confirming that because of insecurity they have ran away and the member went to his ward and confirmed that the facility is closed due to the attack, he does not need to deny it since it is the fact. It is not the wish of the CEC for the mast to be attacked, located in the compound of the facility. He has to be clear on the point and we do not need to gag the mover of the statement on where he feels this is right.

Madam Temporary Speaker, if I may go ahead he is confirming that the facility is fully operational and he knows the personnel ran away from Mandera because of insecurity. He has not shown anywhere where he provided security to the staff to come back to the place. He talked about having local staffs. Why can't we have proof? Hon. Kulow, just hold on. I know you are the member of the committee and we are members of this House. By just saying that he has deployed staff, how can we know that? Which local staff? Which kind of category is that? Honestly, we should not undermine the concern of the elected member who moved the statement in this House.

Madam Temporary Speaker, question number two, due to security situation the department will endeavour to post local staff. Do you think that is the solution? Do you think local staffs are armed? What is the CEC insinuating? Who are the staffs who have been

reallocated? This is actually nonsense and it cannot be moved in this House. It does not make sense to me.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Bishar!

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): While I concur with the statement of Hon. Gabnan, through a visit to the CEC. Secondly, if that one is not palatable it is good for the MCA to write a letter. Thirdly if this option could not work they should seek further statement.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Are you on a point of order or you are contributing?

Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi (Takaba): Madam Temporary Speaker, you have been silent.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member, it is true that I have been silent about you but are you contributing or you are on a point of order?

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): (*technical hitches*) I will not allow that. If you tell me to sit down, I will sit down; if you tell me not to complete, I will not complete. Hon. Members are making noise from behind.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Order! Are you on a point of order or you are contributing?

Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi (Takaba): I want to contribute.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Allow him to finish.

Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi (Takaba): I have a point of information.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): For whom.

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): To the Honorable member who is on the floor. He is trying to insinuate that Hon. Kulow has no valid point.

Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo (Shimpir Fatuma): I do not require his information Madam Temporary Speaker.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): If the Member does not need it, Hon. Bishar, just sit down. Hon. Adan, what is your point of order?

**Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed** (Elwak-North): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. This is an Honorable House which needs Honorable language. Hon. Wariyo used unparliamentarily word. He was terming the response from the department as nonsense. Let him withdraw that statement and continue with his sentiment.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Wariyo, withdraw and substantiate.

**Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo** (Shimpir Fatuma): Madam Temporary Speaker, to me it is the response that is not making sense.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): To you it is not making sense but there are so many members who are going to contribute.

**Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo** (Shimpir Fatuma): I am contributing on my behalf. If at any point I have actually annoyed be it the member for Takaba or El-wak North, I withdraw. But I believe this one does not make any sense if we are to accept the reality. We will be judged by our deeds. I think w when my brother, my elder---

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Yes Honorable Hindia.

**Hon. Hindia Hussein** (Nominated): Madam Temporary Speaker, he has not withdrawn the statement after he said it is useless. That means the health committee and the department are useless. He should withdraw before he continues.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Wariyo, substantiate and use parliamentary words please.

**Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo** (Shimpir Fatuma): I have withdrawn if I have annoyed any person. There is nothing I have for anyone in this House but I want the CEC to put the proper measures by bringing those staffs on the ground as required. We must be loud and clear. I do not shy or fear anyone to say the fact.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Yakub!

**Hon. Yakub Hassan** (Derkhale): Madam Temporary Speaker, this is the response of its kind and the best response I have ever seen. This is because the response of the executive was based on the type of question asked by the Honorable member. If you want a good response from the executive I urge the Hon. Member to come up with very good questions in the first place. The Member who asked that question does not know what he is asking. Madam Temporary Speaker, I will explain myself. I will explain myself!

### (Loud consultations)

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Order Honourable member!

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): I will explain why I said that. Let me substantiate.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Yakub, sit down.

**Hon. Mohamed Ibrahim** (Guticha): Is the Hon. Member in order to insinuate that the Honorable member elected by the people of Waranqara does not know what he is asking? Madam Temporary Speaker, what is he insinuating?

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): I have already noted that. Hon. Yakub, you need to withdraw.

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): I withdraw or substantiate?

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Substantiate.

**Hon. Yakub Hassan** (Derkhale): Thank you, very much. Substantiate is the word. The Hon. Member asked especially for Gari on whether there are staffs? He is not even aware that there is a new staff posted to that facility.

**Hon. Ahmed Gabnan** (Waranqara): Madam Temporary Speaker, I will not allow. I have not asked that question.

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): Let me substantiate and it is procedural. Do not interrupt me.

**Hon. Ahmed Gabnan** (Waranqara): I will not allow Honorable Yakub to use derogatory statement for the second time against me by insinuating that I do not know what I am asking. My question is very clear when I asked about staffing issue. I have not asked if Gari has staffs or not but I asked in the recent newly recruits why there were there no new staffs. I asked about new staff but not who are there. He is the one who is not understanding and he should sit down.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member, however useless it is, any member can raise a statement and the department----

**Hon. Yakub Hassan** (Derkhale): Madam Temporary Speaker, if Honorable member stands here and cannot substantiate what he said then how can we continue with the debate? It is difficult. Can't you allow us to substantiate what we said, understand us, otherwise----?

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Proceed.

**Hon. Yakub Hassan** (Derkhale): Yes I will proceed, in the response and question asked by the Honorable member is new staff and the response is that there are two new staffs and it is very correct. This means the Honorable member is not aware that two new staff members have been posted to Waranqara. He is the one who is wrong and asking wrong questions. That is the fact of the matter. I am asking the Honorable members that the moment you ask questions or bring statement to this House first confirm from the facility in your ward on how many staffs are there and when have they been posted? Are they working or not? That is the fact of the matter and that is what the Honorable member has not confirmed.

On the issue of Waranqara, the incident of terrorism is prior to the staffs being withdrawn from the facility. Nobody, not even the president of Kenya or you Madam Temporary Speaker will stay in a facility which is two hundred metres from where terrorists have blown up a mast. The life of the staffs is important than service delivery to the community. That is the fact of the matter. It is true that terrorists are targeting non-locals and that is why the CEC for health said that the locals are posted there. Let us not try to avoid issues here. Why are terrorist attacking here? They are chasing out non-locals and inflicting economic sabotage. Unless we agree on that, then we are trying to punish the CECs and push for non-issues.

This is a statement of its kind.

I stand to support.

Thank you.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Members, we are now discussing this statement for almost two hours and we have so many businesses on our Order Paper.

**Hon. Mohamed Ibrahim** (Guticha): Madam Temporary Speaker, I seek for your indulgence. I have critical information.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Mohamed Ibrahim.

**Hon. Mohamed Ibrahim** (Guticha): Madam Temporary Speaker, I have worked in Waranqara and I have many close friends there. As we are seated here, I have called the ward administrator for Waranqara and there is no single staff in that facility. The Kenyan Constitution under the economic and social right, Article 43, gives the right to every person in this country including the people of Waranqara, the right to attain the highest standard of health care. We are representatives of the people. Let us not take this matter lightly. This statement is not substantive. You can call him. I will give you his number. There is no single staff in that facility. This statement should be returned.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Kulow, what is your point of order?

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): My point of order is the information given by the Honorable Member for Guticha is not---

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): It is true. I know what I will say Hon. Kulow. I have an answer for him.

Hon. Mohamed Ibrahim (Guticha): Madam Temporary Speaker, it is a lie.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Order! Order Hon. Members! I will not allow. Kindly sit down. Honorable Members, I have already shared with you that. The statement needs to be discussed for only one hour and we are taking almost two hours. Kindly, can Members contributing take two minutes? Two minutes is enough.

**Hon. Alinoor Derow** (Wargadud): Madam Temporary Speaker, the response is adequate and in fact it is to the point and the questions have been clearly answered.

The issue at hand is, was the statement raised after the terror attack or it was raised before the terror attack. The Honorable Member must also, besides service delivery, be concerned about the staff posted there. It is necessary that at least the Honorable Member could have used other avenues to ensure that the security of those staffs is taken care of.

The other issue is that the questions have been asked well because if you look at the duration when the question were asked and the date of response, I think it has been answered in two weeks' time. Already the facility has been operationalized according to this response. The issue he is referring--- protect me Madam Temporary Speaker.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Order members! Hon. Leader of Majority!

**Hon. Abdi Adan** (Neboi): Madam Temporary Speaker, I seek your indulgence. I do not know why we are debating a statement. The statement was sought by Honorable member from the department of Health. This response was written by the CEC for Health. Why don't we leave to the committee, the chair of the committee and the member who sought the statement to get satisfied before we interrupt, abuse each other and talk a lot of? It has not been the precedent of this House. Madam Temporary Speaker, give us direction. We should not be debating statement where everybody is giving his opinion. We are not looking for opinion of members. The member knows why he is asking. When he said the staffs are not there and he has gone to the ward and he knows, another member cannot say that the staffs are there.

So, I want you to give direction, limit the statement to the member who is asking and the Chair of the committee who is responding.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Abass!

Hon. Abass Abdille (Nominated): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I happen to be the member for health committee. We discussed this response and we found it satisfactory. When the member elected from that Ward raises a concern about staffs, as alleged by the department, we need to substantiate. The appropriate way is for the committee to go back and verify because we cannot deny the reality. I indulge you that as committee we can go back and make inquiry on the staffs present. The staff present can be verified. When staffs come into the facility there are those books they log in and log out. So, if the other response is satisfactory, then that it is immaterial. We can discuss matters of staffs and verify that through the department.

Thank you.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Members, I am now ruling on this one. I direct the Committee on Health to go back, ask for response and respond to this House one week after recess.

We have two Motions. Because of time, there is Motion number two which is a shorter one. So, we go to number two and then we come back to number one. Motion two?

## MOTION

#### Adoption of the report of the Committee on Selection

Hon. Abdi Adan (Neboi): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I wish to move the following Motion –

THAT this County Assembly adopts the report of the Committee on Selection

On behalf of the Members of the Committee on Selection and pursuant to the provision of Standing Order No. 155 (1) (2) and 156 (1), it is my pleasure and duty to present to the County Assembly, the committees report of the Committee on Selection, Mandera County Assembly.

Ownership of the committee, the Members of the committee have signed, I hope the Members have copies of the report.

Madam Temporary Speaker, the Committee on Selection is one of the select committee designated to nominate members to serve in the committees, save for the Membership of the County Assembly Business Committee and Committee on Appointment pursuant to the provision of the Standing Order No.155(2).

Madam Temporary Speaker, Standing Order No. 156 (1), requires that; -

"Unless otherwise provided by any written law or these Standing Orders, the Committee on Selection shall, in consultation with County Assembly parties, nominate Members who shall serve on a Select Committee."

Madam Temporary Speaker, Standing Order No. 157 (1) requires the Committee on Selection shall ensure that the Membership of each committee reflects the relative majorities of the seats held by each of the County Assembly parties in the County Assembly.

Madam Temporary Speaker, composition of the Committee on Selection is as follows -

- 1. Hon. Abdi Adan Ali -Chairperson
- 2. Hon. Jimale Abdi
- 3. Hon. Shamsa Ibrahim Maalim
- 4. Hon. Fatuma Omar Kasai
- 5. Hon. Yakub Hassan Eymoi
- 6. Hon. Abdinur Diisow Teno
- 7. Hon. Amran Adan Abdirahman
- 8. Hon. Hussein Adan Haji
- 9. Hon. Farah Abdi Abdinoor
- 10. Hon. Ibrahim Ali Wariyo
- 11. Hon. Noor Mohamud Abdinur
- 12. Hon. Rahma Ibrahim Issack
- 13. Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed
- 14. Hon. Yussuf Maalim Dakane
- 15. Hon. Saad Sheikh Ahmed
- 16. Hon. Issack Dahir Abdi
- 17. Hon. Nasra Noor Mohamed

Madam Temporary Speaker, on 13<sup>th</sup> August 2020, the Committee on Selection received communication from the Jubilee party through its Minority Party Whip resolution of the party on the replacement of a Member to the Budget and Appropriations Committee following the discharge of Honorable Abdullahi Yunis Guliye from the Budget and Appropriations Committee.

The Jubilee party through resolution of the party vide letter dated on 11<sup>th</sup> August 2020 nominated Hon. Jimale Abdi Hassan to serve in the Budget and Appropriations committee.

Following the resolution of the Jubilee party and in compliance with the provision of Standing Order No. 156 (1 \$ 2) and 157 (1), the Committee on Selection recommends that the County Assembly approves the nomination of Honorable Jimale Abdi Hassan to serve in the Budget and Appropriations Committee.

Madam Temporary Speaker, the report is short and brief because this is the committee placement and it is done in line with parties' request. Attachments are there, you can see we have the minutes of the Committee on Selection.

I want to urge the House to approve and adopt the report so that the Member will sit in the budget committee. Honorable Members are aware the issues surrounding the budget committee has taken long. There has been a lot of lobbing and so many other things going on in the Jubilee party and NARC Kenya party. We are happy that at long last the NARC Kenya party has settled their wrangles and they have nominated their Member yesterday through the communication from the chair. The only Member remaining now is one from the Jubilee party which must also be done maybe after we come back from the recess.

Therefore, I will ask honorable Yakub to second me.

Thank you. Hon. Yakub Hassan: Seconded

(Question Proposed)

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member for Morothile.

**Hon. Abdullahi Yunis** (Morothile): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. This matter cannot be discussed since there is a court order and it is already in court. This is the House of rules and procedures and it cannot break the same law that we have made. I request this issue to be stopped until it will be resolved. There is a court order. The clerk has received it at 2:30 p.m and I think it has been sent through email since there is this issue of Corona virus. We cannot discuss this matter as at now.

Thank you.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Honorable Member for Morothile, I am not aware of any court order that has been received by the office of the clerk.

**Hon. Abdullahi Yunis** (Morothile): Madam Temporary Speaker, I have the evidence. This is the evidence and he is the one who signed and I received my copy. There is CCTV and I have all the evidence that the clerk has received. If you ignore it that is up to you but I have said it and it is on HANSARD for record purpose. This matter is before a court and it will be discuss later. If you ignore it, it is up to you but I am telling you for record purpose this matter is before the court.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Honorable Member, I have told you and I repeat, I am not aware.

Hon. Abdullahi Yunis (Morothile): This is the evidence that I have that the Clerk signed.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Honorable Member, I have been guided by the clerk. There is no original copy received by the Office of the Clerk. That is the information that I have before I entered this House. Any Member who wants to contribute? Yes honorable Kulow.

**Hon. Kulow Alio** (Rhamu): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I might not contribute much because this is Jubilee affairs but I want to throw in a word of caution.

It is true as per Standing Order No. 156 and 157 every party has the right to nominate its Members to any committee. That is acceptable. The Committee on Selection has to do its work and place the Members as per the suggestion floated by the respective parties.

My concern is I have not seen the attachment of the minutes of the Jubilee party because decision made in the party is guided by consensus and majority of the Members present. I do not sit in the Selection Committee. I do not sit in the jubilee party when they do their work but I am guided by as an honorable Member is what is presented on the floor of the House. Therefore, my concern is that we have not seen any attachment of the Jubilee party and how many Members attended. Protect me Madam Temporary Speaker, I have not finished. Thank you, for protecting me. That one I do not see it. That is my own personal view.

Secondly, we should take care of Standing Order No. 88 as well. Anything before the court should not be discussed. We need to take that it into account. Just a word of caution.

Thirdly, there are other issues in the Public Service Committee. As we are speaking they have eight Members each. Their Members were de-whipped by the Speaker and they were placed in finance and public service. Later, a resolution was reached and the Members wanted to be taken back to where they came from; Public Service and Finance Committee.

As we are speaking, we are having quorum hitches as Members of Public Service and Finance because we have eight Members. When there are critical issues to be discussed in the committee then it becomes a problem. This is long overdue. It is two months and those issues need to be addressed because there is a reason my committee are nine Members. The nine Members are normally time breakers. These two committees have no time breakers and their decisions are hampered and risky. We need direction on that.

# Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Majority Leader!

**Hon. Abdi Adan** (Neboi): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I want to respond to what honorable Kulow just said. As much As much we know that the Committee on Selection is supposed to be placing Members; the Standing Orders says, in consultation with the parties.

On the issue of the minutes, I received as the chair of the committee both the minutes and the resolution of the Jubilee party placing honorable Jimale in that committee and I satisfied that the minutes has been signed by almost ten Members out of the seventeen Jubilee Members. I can table it before the House and for record purpose I think honorable Kulow can get a copy from the clerk.

Thirdly, on the Committee of the Public Service, we know that honorable Abdirashid and honorable Gabnan have issues surrounding them. What happened after---

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Majority Leader, we are not discussing about public service. He just said it. You can for go that.

Hon. Abdi Adan (Neboi): Okay.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member for Wargadud.

**Hon. Alinoor Derow** (Wargadud): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I think regarding the issue being discussed, on the court order, a committee of this House is has powers equivalent to a high court.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member, I have already ruled that one that. I have not received any communication from the Office of the Clerk and that bars me from discussing this issue.

Hon. Alinoor Derow (Wargadud): Then going to the whole issue that this Assembly has-

--

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): Point of order!

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Yes

**Hon. Yakub Hassan** (Derkhale): Madam Temporary Speaker, for us to discuss the report, you have to propose so that we contribute

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): I have proposed.

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker.

**Hon. Alinoor Derow** (Wargadud): Madam Temporary Speaker, I think this House has set a precedent previously regarding the placement of honorable Members in various committees. Personally I have been a victim. We have never had any party resolution placed in front of this House. Precedent set in this House becomes a rule and when a party communicates the honorable Member should be invited so that at least his dissenting voice or anything has to be recorded. When an honorable Member is present and issue has been taken and he has not been invited to a party resolution that is infringing the right of an individual. Today the Majority Leader is placing the minutes, can he produce also the previous minutes of which---

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member for Wargadud, can you come clear on this. Are you supporting the report or opposing the report. You either support or oppose the Motion.

Hon. Alinoor Derow (Wargadud): I support.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Member for Takaba.

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): Madam Temporary Speaker, I think removing and discharging of a Member from one committee to another is not new to us and we need to be a bit sober. Some of us have swallowed that pill with a lot of easiness. There has been a time when I was discharged from the PAC chair. My party, EFP, called for a meeting at 3:45p.m and the meeting ended at 4:00 p.m.

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): I think honorable Member, we are discussing this Motion. Order honorable Members! Honorable Member, we are discussing this Motion, you either support or oppose.

Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi (Takaba): I am supporting Madam Temporary Speaker.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Then contribute. Do not go for other issues.

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): But I am talking about the incident that had happened in this House.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): That one has been over taken by events. Proceed.

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): Madam Temporary Speaker, even after that the way honorable Alinoor Derow said, even today Jubilee party has brought a lot of evidence beyond reasonable doubt that were not there in EFP. We accepted the decision of our EFP party. We have not gone for any court direction. My brother honorable Abdullahi Yunis Guliye must accept the verdict of the party because this is a deep state issue. We have to comply and you cannot reach anywhere. Let me advice you.

Hon. Mohamed Rashid (Kutulo): Point of order!

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): What is your point of order honorable Mohamed?

**Hon. Mohamed Rashid** (Kutulo): Can my elder brother honorable Bishar substantiate what he means by the 'deep state'?

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): What is it honorable Bishar?

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): Madam Temporary Speaker, it means if you are not in tandem with the manifesto of the party---

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Proceed honorable Bishar.

**Hon. Bishar Maalim Abdullahi** (Takaba): Finally, I would like to say that I support this Motion and if he has been de-whipped from the Budget Committee, everybody wants to join, time has reached and when his term is ending because of one, two, three reasons he has to retire honorably.

# (Question put and agreed to)

# Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Next Motion!

# **MOTION**

# Adoption of the report of Land, Housing and Physical Planning Committee on El-wak Municipal Charter (Amendment) 2020

Hon. Hindia Hussein (Nominated): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I beg to move-

# THAT this County Assembly adopts the report of Land, Housing and Physical Planning Committee on El-wak Municipal Charter (Amendment), 2020

The Sectoral Committee on Lands, Housing and Physical Planning derives its mandate from provisions of Standing Order 193(5). The functions of the Committee are as follows;

- a) To investigate, inquire into, and report on all matters relating to the mandate, management, activities, administration, operations and estimates of the assigned departments;
- b) To study the programs and policy objectives of departments and the Effectiveness of their implementation;
- c) To study and review all legislation referred to it;
- d) To study, assess and analyze the relative success of the departments measured by the results obtained as compared with their stated objectives;

- e) To investigate and inquire into all matters relating to the assigned departments as may be deemed necessary, and as may be referred to it by the County Assembly;
- f) To vet and report on all appointments where the Constitution or any law requires the County Assembly to approve, except those under Standing Order 188 (Committee on appointments); and
- g) To make reports and recommendations to the Assembly as often as possible, including recommendations of proposed legislation.

Member

Member

Member

The following are the Members of the Committee as constituted by the house; -Chairperson

- 1. Hon. Halima Billow Omar-
- 2. Hon. Hindia Hussein Ibrahim vice Chairperson
- 3. Hon. Adan Maalim Abdullahi
- 4. Hon. Abass Abdille Mohamed Member
- 5. Hon. Abdinur Diisow Teno
- 6. Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed
- 7. Hon. Abdi Adan Ali Member
- 8. Hon. Amran Adan Abdirahman Member
- 9. Hon. Nasra Noor Mohamed Member

The Committee wishes to thank the offices of the Speaker and the Clerk to the County Assembly for supporting the committee in carrying out its mandate.

I would like to also thank the Honorable Members for their cooperation, teamwork and commitment in coming up with this report.

I wish to confirm that the recommendations of the Committee in this report were unanimously adopted.

It is therefore my pleasant duty and privilege on behalf of Lands, Housing and Physical Planning Committee to present the committee's report on El-wak Municipal Charter (Amendments) 2020 for approval by the Assembly.

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): Point of information Madam Temporary Speaker?

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): What is your point of information?

Hon. Yakub Hassan (Derkhale): Madam Temporary Speaker, the Committee on Lands laid this report as a Notice of Motion yesterday. All the honorable Members have read this report fully. Now that she has read the acknowledgement, I request the honorable Member to read the recommendation so that we go for discussion. It is also prayer time.

Thank you.

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Hindia!

Hon. Hindia Hussein (Nominated): Madam Temporary Speaker, I am perusing through the important part so that it will be captured on HANSARD.

We, the Members of Lands, Housing and Physical Planning Committee, do append our signatures against our names to this report to affirm the correctness of the contents and support for the report.

The Committee unanimously adopts the proposed amendments with regard to El-wak Municipal Charter (Amendments) 2020 as submitted by the Governor H.E Ali I. Roba by inserting the following new sub-clauses immediately after clause (2) 1.) Boundaries

- i. The boundary of the Municipality of El-wak shall be El-wak south and El-wak North Wards of Mandera South Constituency or as may subsequently be altered.
- ii. That the municipality activities shall not adversely affect the grazing land rights of pastoralists as well as other pastoralists' activities within El-wak Municipality except the area currently covered by El-wak town.
- iii. Municipality activities mentioned in sub-clause (i) include bylaws, rules, zoning, physical planning, land use and land tenure. (Copy annexed).

The committee observed that;

- 1. That the County Governor complied with the requirement of Clause 48 (1) and (2) of the El-wak Municipal Charter 2020.
- 2. That the amendment to this Charter is compliant with the national legislation, County legislation and any other written relevant laws.
- 3. That the El-wak Municipal Charter amendments, 2020 is in line with consent agreement between the parties (Petitioners and Respondents).
- 4. The Committee also observed that the municipal activities will not adversely affect the grazing land rights of the pastoralists as well as other pastoral activities once the amendment is adopted.

The Committee recommends that this County Assembly approves the report of the Committee on the proposed amendments to the El-wak Municipal Charter (Amendments) 2020 as per provision of Clause 48 (1) and (2) of El-wak Municipal Charter 2020.

Madam Temporary Speaker, the rest are attachments from the committee. Also there is a letter from His Excellency the Governor while he was making the updates. I would like to request honorable majority leader to second me.

Hon. Abdi Adan Ali: Seconded

# (Question Proposed)

Temporary Speaker (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Hon. Adan!

**Hon. Adan Maalim Mohamed** (El-wak North): Thank you, Madam Temporary Speaker. I stand to support the report of Lands, Housing and Physical Planning Committee on the amendment of El-wak Municipal charter 2020. The greater people of El-wak have been waiting for long to have the Municipality status conferred to El-wak town. As you are aware El-wak is the largest town after Mandera East. The service that they are waiting for long will be provided by this Municipality upon confirmation.

The issue of sanitation, street lighting and drainage that the people are enduring in Elwak can only be solved by this amendment and the charter that was previously approved by this House.

With that, I would like to request all the Members to support this report and adopt it so that we have the municipality status conferred on El-wak.

I request you to put the question. Thank you.

(*Question put and agreed to*)

#### ADJOURNMENT

**Temporary Speaker** (Hon. Sokorey M. Issackow): Honorable Members, I now adjourn the House to 8<sup>th</sup> September 2020, at 2:30 p.m.